

**AGENDA REPORT
PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING
July 21, 2022**

SUMMARY

A request by Crockett Engineering Consultants (agent), on behalf of D&D Investments of Columbia LLC (owner), for approval to rezone a 0.7-acre site that is currently zoned R-1 (One-family dwelling) to M-OF (Mixed-use Office) to allow a dental office use. The property is located at the southeast corner of West Broadway and Manor Drive. (**Case #197-2022**)

DISCUSSION

The applicant is seeking to rezone 0.7 acres of property to M-OF zoning. The site is currently vacant; however, was previously improved with a single-family dwelling that was demolished between 2011 and 2015. The requested M-OF zoning permits principally professional office uses and a limited number of commercial uses defined as “Personal Services”. Personal Service uses within an M-OF structure are limited to a maximum of 2500 sq.ft. per tenant space and cannot exceed a total of 5000 sq.ft per building. A conditional use is required for a single tenant space or total building to exceed these limitations. The full listing of uses allowed within the M-OF district are shown in Table 29-3.1 of the UDC, which is attached.

The property is bordered on three sides by public streets W. Broadway Street (north), Manor Drive (west), and Maplewood Drive (east). According to the CATSO major roadway plan Broadway is classified as a major arterial, Manor is classified as a neighborhood collector, and Maplewood Drive is classified a local residential. R-1 zoning surrounds the subject site on the east, west, and south. There are existing single-family structures on the lots to the east and south and a religious institution with a daycare facility to the west. To the north, across Broadway, the property is zoned R-2 (Two-family Dwelling), and is currently vacant.

The applicant has stated that the purpose of the rezoning action is to allow the site to be redeveloped with a single-story dentist office. This use is permitted within the M-OF district and is defined as an “Office” within the Permitted Use Table of the UDC. The applicant has submitted a preliminary site plan and architectural elevations illustrating the location and appearance of the future improvements. While the drawings provide a better understanding of the intended use, it is important to note that such submission is non-binding upon the applicant as the request is not proposed to be a PD (planned development). The inclusion of such materials; however, reflects that the applicant has a clear intention for the redevelopment of the site versus a more speculative rezoning request.

Zoning

Changes in zoning are evaluated from several perspectives, the first being how the zoning correlates with the city’s land use planning documents and their corresponding future land use designations. The Columbia Imagined comprehensive plan identifies the subject site as being within the land use category of “Neighborhood”. Per the comprehensive plan, Neighborhood Districts permit a range of residential uses, as well as “a limited number of nonresidential uses that provide services to neighborhood residents”. The comprehensive plan also identifies an existing Commercial District, Broadway Shopping Center anchored by the Gerbes supermarket, on the north side of Broadway west of the subject site. Furthermore, as illustrated on page 123 of Columbia Imagined, several locations of either existing or potential commercial nodes and marketplaces have been identified within the surrounding area.

The following factors have been considered by staff as part of its analysis of this requested action and establish the basis by which it has arrived at its recommendation.

CIRCUMSTANCES SUPPORTING APPROVAL OF M-OF

- **Surrounding zoning** - Nearby residential uses will have access to a potentially walkable mixed-use office/retail node that may provide services to residents. The proposed use of the site as a dentist office is considered generally a low-impact use that would serve as a buffer to the abutting residential properties to the south. There is a religious institution located to the west of the site.
- **Future Land Use Designation** – Columbia Imagined designates this site as “Neighborhood”, which can include some office/commercial uses. While some commercial uses may be appropriate in certain locations to serve the needs of surrounding residential uses, these services should be provided by lower intensity, non-auto oriented uses that are generally permitted in M-OF and M-N. Higher density residential uses are also appropriate to provide housing variety.
- **Location** - The property is located at a signalized intersection of two major streets - an arterial and a neighborhood collector. Such locations may be considered appropriate sites capable of supporting mixed-use development as they provide good access management to the site and potentially could support public transportation facilities given the classification of the intersecting roadways.
- **Design** - As mentioned previously, the submitted site plan and elevations will not bind the applicant to the construction shown; however, does reflect a building that would be respectfully integrated into the adjoining neighborhood. The building is placed towards the street and away from the residential house to the south, providing a more pedestrian friendly and engaging streetscape. The parking is placed behind the proposed structure where it can be more effectively screened from view of the adjoining residential development by a Level 3 property edge buffer that would include, at a minimum, an 8-foot tall screening device and 10-foot landscaping buffer. The site also benefits from not having residential uses directly to its west in that there is less of a dramatic change for any residents that may have been located there and been subject to a change in view from a neighboring residential property to the view of a parking lot.

CIRCUMSTANCES SUPPORTING DENIAL OF M-OF

- **Surrounding zoning** - While the zoning and present uses of the properties surrounding the subject site may benefit from the requested rezoning, that zoning and those land uses may also support a reason for denial of the request given the potential to create a land use conflict and inconsistency with the comprehensive plan. It is not uncommon to have residential development abutting a non-residential use or site. This type of situation often is intentional and used to transition from more intense to less intense development. Successful transitions often rely on the effectiveness of the buffer between the completing land uses more so than the differences in the land uses themselves.

While the proposed M-OF district is comprised generally of professional office uses it does allow a limited number of personal service commercial uses. Guidance from the comprehensive plan suggests that a buffer be located between residential and commercial uses which is ideally achieved by a natural buffer such as a stream or tree preservation area. Given the subject site’s environmental surroundings this type of buffer is not possible; therefore, reliance on the screening

and buffering standards of Article 4 of the UDC would have to be considered sufficient.

While establishing an adequate buffer between the completing uses may be achievable, a more important question to be resolved is if the subject site's rezoning is necessary given the substantial commercial district to the northwest (Broadway Shopping Center) and the comprehensive plan's recommended locations for commercial nodes. There are nearby existing commercial district is capable of accommodating the proposed use without the necessity to establish new buffers to mitigate the possible impacts that rezoning and redevelopment would create. Furthermore, locating the proposed use within one of those districts would afford residents access to the proposed dental clinic within a comfortable walking distance.

Given the M-OF district does permit limited personal service commercial uses, this request could be viewed as establishing a new commercial node at the intersection of Manor and W. Broadway. Commercial nodes are envisioned as mixed-use areas at neighborhood edges that can provide new housing options and low impact non-residential uses in proximity to lower density residential areas as a means of promoting more livable and walkable neighborhoods. These nodes can be more easily designed into newly developing areas, but infill sites do present more challenges given that the area is already developed and proper buffering to mitigate impacts on existing residents may not be possible.

The subject site; however, does not align with the intent of a commercial node given its close proximity to an existing commercial district that provides a wide range of commercial services already. The benefits of an infill node are principally that it would provide nearby services to an area that does not have any within walking distance. In this case, the nearby residents have ample access to nearby non-residential services, albeit not a dental clinic. Given the abundance of these services it is believed there would be little additional benefit to nearby residents.

The comprehensive plan identifies a half-mile as the ideal distance between nodes. A node is located less than one-half mile east of this site already on the north side of Broadway, that includes office spaces currently - the Lake Broadway offices. Just east of that site is D&H Drugstore and Diggitt Graphics at the intersection of Broadway and West Boulevard. Furthermore, as illustrated on page 123 of the comprehensive plan, there are several additional locations of nodes (commons and marketplaces) of which the subject site is not identified.

- **Nearby vacant property** - While only tangentially related, property directly across Broadway from this site is a nearly 5-acre tract that is currently vacant and zoned R-2 (Two-family dwelling). This site was previously developed with residential homes which have since been demolished. This site could be considered a good candidate for redevelopment with more residential density in the existing R-2, or could also be the subject of a rezoning request itself to allow a wider range of uses. The uncertainty of the future of this 5-acre tract impacts the subject property in that it may be better suited for the inclusion of some commercial zoning as well as new residential uses. Development of this tract may be more successful in integrating mixed-uses than can be accomplished on the subject site, although given the previously discussed proximity to the commercial district, higher density residential zoning may be the best option here as well.

In addition, Clinkscales Road, which starts at Broadway and goes north, is classified as a major collector (versus Manor Drive as a neighborhood collector), which means it is expected to handle higher volumes of traffic than Manor Drive. And while both streets have driveways from single-family homes that directly access to them, Clinkscales does have fewer than Manor.

The area that the 5-acre tract is located within has also been the subject of a neighborhood plan, the [West Central Columbia Neighborhood Action Plan](#). The plan does specifically identify the tract as a priority for upzoning to “support neighborhood mixed use corners” (Land Use & Zoning, Priority 2, pg. 33). It does stress that the uses should meet the needs of local residents, and not substantially impact traffic flow. Priority 4 goes on to recommend that higher density housing should be located east of Broadway Shopping Center, which would correspond to the 5-acres tract. However, it should be noted that the recommendations of this neighborhood plan do not necessarily carry over onto the subject site since it is not included within the plan’s area. The subject site is not currently included in a neighborhood plan at this time.

Conclusion

The conversion of the site to a dentist office would likely have a low impact on the surrounding infrastructure, and would have fewer negative impacts on surrounding residential uses than a commercial use. The location of the site at the intersection of major roadways that are signalized fits within the scope of locations that may be appropriate for uses beyond residential.

However, the upzoning of this site does not appear to directly align with the goals of Columbia Imagined. The surrounding properties are well served by a large commercial district within 300 feet of the subject site, so the location of an infill node on the subject property appears unnecessary. Furthermore, the subject site doesn’t abut the existing commercial district where it rezoning could be considered a natural expansion of that district.

Finally, there is a significant amount of uncertainty with the 5 acres of vacant property located just north of the subject site. This acreage may be better suited for an upzoning to permit mixed use development allowing for the proposed dental clinic as part of a more comprehensive development plan.

Given the surrounding land use characteristics, inconsistency with the comprehensive plans goals and objectives for nodal development, and the subject site’s location along a major street it may be best suited for higher density residential infill rather than the proposed M-OF.

RECOMMENDATION

Denial of the rezoning to M-OF.

SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS (ATTACHED)

- Locator Maps
- Surrounding Zoning Graphic
- Columbia Imagined Excerpts
- Permitted Use List
- Preliminary Site Plan
- Preliminary Building Elevations

SITE CHARACTERISTICS

Area (acres)	0.7
Topography	Slight slope to east
Vegetation/Landscaping	Turf, limited trees
Watershed/Drainage	County House Branch
Existing structures	None

HISTORY

Annexation date	1946, 1955
Zoning District	R-1
Land Use Plan designation	Neighborhood
Previous Subdivision/Legal Lot Status	Surveyed tract, not a legal lot

UTILITIES & SERVICES

Site provided with all City services.

ACCESS

Broadway	
Location	Along the north side of property
Major Roadway Plan	Minor Arterial (Improved and City maintained); 84-100-foot full width/42-50-foot half-width required; Additional right-of-way dedication required in the future.
CIP projects	Sidewalks on south side from Maplewood east to West Blvd (2024); and sidewalks west of Manor to Stadium (2026)
Sidewalk	Sidewalks existing

Manor Drive	
Location	Along the west side of property
Major Roadway Plan	Neighborhood Collector (Improved and City maintained); 60-foot full width/30-foot half-width required; Additional right-of-way dedication required in the future.
CIP projects	None
Sidewalk	Sidewalks required upon platting

Maplewood Drive	
Location	Along the east side of property
Major Roadway Plan	NA
CIP projects	Traffic Calming (2022)
Sidewalk	Sidewalks required upon platting

PARKS & RECREATION

Neighborhood Parks	Clary-Shy Community Park, Again Street Park located within half-mile.
Trails Plan	No trails within half-mile.
Bicycle/Pedestrian Plan	None

PUBLIC NOTIFICATION

All property owners within 200 feet and City-recognized neighborhood associations within 1,000 feet of the boundaries of the subject property were notified of this pending request on June 22, 2022. Twelve postcards were distributed.

Report prepared by Clint Smith

Approved by Patrick Zenner