

EXCERPTS
PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING
OCTOBER 18, 2018

Case 18-180

A request by Crockett Engineering (agent), on behalf of the City of Columbia (owner), seeking rezoning and PD Plan approval for development of a 10-lot single-family subdivision to be known as "Cullimore Cottages". The subject 1.32-acre site is presently zoned R-MF and is located 350 feet south of the intersection of North Boulevard and 8th Street.

MS. LOE: Before I ask for a staff report, is there anyone who needs to recuse themselves? Mr. Stanton?

MR. STANTON: Madam Chairman, I'm going to ask to recuse myself from this case due to the fact I'm on the executive board relating to this case, so I recuse myself.

MS. LOE: Thank you. All right. So Mr. Stanton has asked for a recusal.

Mr. TOOHEY: I also am going to recuse myself.

MS. LOE: Okay. Mr. Toohey is also asking for a recusal. This leaves us with six which is still a quorum, so we are free to move ahead. May we have a staff report, please?

Staff report was given by Mr. Rusty Palmer of the Planning and Development Department. Staff recommends approval of the requested PD zoning and its accompanying Statement of Intent as well as the PD Plan to be known as "Cullimore Cottages PD Plan".

MR. ZENNER: And just so the Commissioners are aware, the property is currently R-MF, which is a multi-family zoning district. The majority of this property is obviously underdeveloped to that density standard, so the proposed densities on this subject set of lots is not inconsistent with the R-MF maximum permitted density. It's just in a different configuration than we would normally see.

MS.LOE: Thank you, Mr. Palmer. Before I ask for any Commission's questions, I'd like to ask if any Commissioners had any ex parte prior to this meeting related to Case 18-180 to please disclose that now so all Commissioners have the same information in to consider on behalf of this case.

Mr. MacMann?

MR. MACMANN: Just to reiterate what I said before, I am member of this neighborhood association and I do attend the meetings where we were given briefings, but I am not a voting member.

MS. LOE: Thank you. I would also like to disclose that Mr. Cole described the stormwater system to me for this property, but that's all the information that was disclosed. Any discussion or questions for staff? Seeing none, I'd like to open up the public comment.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

MR. COLE: Thank you, Madam Chairperson. I have a PowerPoint that I could run through rather quickly and succinctly. My name is --

MS. LOE: Yes. Name and address, please.

MR. COLE: My name is Randy Cole; I'm in the Housing Programs Division of the Community Development Department. We're at 500 East Walnut. So really excited to be here tonight and talk about this plan. A little review of what I was going to talk about is just the goals of the plan, kind of the history of how it came to be, because I think that plays into a lot of how the site plan is laid out, so the public engagement we did, what community land trust are I'll touch on briefly and answer any questions that folks may have that may not be familiar with that, and then just a little overview of the plan to tie it all together. So really the goals of this project, we heard affordability mentioned in the last case. It's to provide affordable owner-occupied housing in the neighborhood to also be used as a means to stabilizing the neighborhood and neighborhoods who already have a concentration of rentals, we have found that bringing in homeowners really stabilizing the neighborhood and has a good impact for the neighborhood. We wanted to meet the collective vision of the neighborhood, so we really involved the neighborhood a lot on the front end of this in planning and planning out how the site was laid out, what the density was, what the homes will be intended to look like, so that was a big goal of the -- of what we went through. Also we wanted to protect our investments and these home ownership opportunities, so that's why we're involving the Columbia Community Land Trusts so this can all be protected for future generations. Then we want to leverage our nonprofit and private developers, such as Habitat, Job Point, CMCA, and then also our private sector developers to develop all these properties, which is similar to how we did our project over at Lynn Street Cottages. Then we also feel that a good goal of a lot of our projects is increasing the tax base of the neighborhood. I won't go too far into this, but if you look at the three properties of what the annual property taxes were before our development, because we haven't developed yet, it's about \$336 per year. After we're done, we estimate it will be about \$12,000 per year, so that's a really big economic impact on all of our services provided by us, the county, the schools, and so on and so forth. So just to touch briefly on community land trusts, they're nonprofit, community-based organizations, typically 501(3)(c) status. They're typically on a three-part government structure; one-third community at large members that typically have expertise in housing, finance, real estate, things like that; a third of the board that was made up of actual neighborhood members from the neighborhoods where we develop homes; and then the remaining third is made up of homeowners that actually live in the homes. So they have all the key stakeholders at the table to make sure what we do is meeting the needs of the neighborhood and also making good sound business decisions. The community land trust are a tool to protect investments in affordable housing, so the land trust maintains ownership of the land and sells just the improvements and then authorizes the use of the land through a 99-year ground lease. And what the ground lease does is it stipulates what the homes can be resold at, so all that public subsidy that we put into the properties to make them affordable is protected for future buyers, as well as the use of being owner occupied. And some of the history of the project, we named it Cullimore Cottages. We named it after Dan Cullimore. I know several of you know Dan, but if you don't, he was very active in the North-Central Neighborhood Association, was a strong advocate for the neighborhood. He worked for Job Point for quite some time. Was just a really good person that cared a lot about his community, that was really active, and he was

very instrumental in the Columbia Community Land Trust coming to fruition. I approached him in April of 2016 to get on our board and potentially look at doing a project on this property at some point in the future, and he joined up and was very instrumental in forming the Columbia Community Land Trust. He invited me out to the neighborhood association meetings. Also incorporated into our bylaws, a description of what the neighborhood representatives should be, and this is kind of Dan in a nutshell. He put into our bylaws that says representing the demographics, cultural perspectives, and broader interests of the neighborhoods where CLT homes are being developed. So it's kind of a nice way to bake in some values in our bylaws and a good reflection of -- of who Dan is. Dan had to step down due to his battle with cancer in June of 20 -- or June 10th of 2017. Then Susan Maze, who has been really instrumental in helping us go through the planning process with the neighborhood has taken over the North-Central Neighborhood Association president and also serves on the Community Land Trust Board. Dan passed in December of 2017, but we've continued our planning. Susan has been instrumental in meeting with the neighborhood over the course of the last six to eight months. Council approved us buying two additional lots because a lot of the planning we did early on with the neighborhood said we don't want you to do just one lot, we have multiple lots here in a row. We could -- we could do a lot more for the neighborhood and get a lot more units there. So that's something we did and something Council approved, so here we are. Susan hosted an event in July that was reflective of a lot of the input we had received over the last two years, and it was basically Mr. Crockett came in and gave a site plan layout that was an interpretation of all of the input that we had received over the course of two years and it was very well received. We had some suggestions for changes and we tried to incorporate all those suggestions the best we could and that's where we landed. Some of the values of the neighborhood that they wanted, we did a survey as well. They really wanted energy-efficient homes, stormwater is a really important thing for the neighborhood. That's a really high need and something that was really stressed at a lot of our meetings. They also wanted solar panels. I'm not sure if we'll get there depending on costs. But another big thing was custom exterior design features that blend well with the neighborhood, so that's something we're going to really try to make an effort to do when we bid out the homes. So as far as the site plan goes, they really want us to incorporate stormwater. I mentioned energy efficiency. They also want a variety of homes, three-bedroom, two bath, and two-bedroom, one bath, so we've incorporated some conceptual diagrams of variations in homes. Narrow windows, extended eaves, roof pitch consistent with the neighborhood, a cottage feel. They also want us to maximize saving trees, so we've done the best we can so far, saved some trees along the back alleyway that I think several of them, those probably will eventually come down, looking at where the sidewalks go, but we do have the Catalpa trees saved on there, which was a high priority of several neighborhood members, so I'm glad that it looks like we're going to be able to save that one. So this is the plan itself. It has -- all the addresses are off of North Eighth. One big thing that the neighborhood wanted on those homes on North Eighth Street was rear-loading garages, so that was part of the impetus of putting in those wider driveways there which are reflective of we did over at Lynn Street Cottages, but it will also help with fire access to the back. The

neighborhood also wanted them to front, you know, the alleyway and North Eighth Street, and I saw the red thing going, so I'll wrap up.

MS. LOE: We just -- we've been running late. If you just have a few final points you would like to make, that would be great.

MR. COLE: Yeah. Well, I think -- I think what we have here is a really good collective view of what the neighborhood wants. I think we have a really high quality project over at Lynn Street, and this is going to incorporate a lot of the things that we did well there. Also some of the tweaks of the things that we learned from there, so I think it's got a high -- high opportunity for success.

MS. LOE: Thank you, Mr. Cole. Are there any questions for this speaker? I see none. Thank you. Is there anyone else that would like to come forward and speak on this plan?

MR. HEMMELGARN: Good evening, Madam Chairperson, Commissioners. My name is Robert Hemmelgarn; I live at 805 Alton Avenue. I'm the vice president of the North-Central Columbia Neighborhood Association Board and I'm here on behalf of that organization this evening. I first want to thank you for taking time to hear and consider input from our neighborhood. It means a lot. We're -- we're a group of residents and neighbors who are dedicated to seeing the -- that the best interests of our neighborhood and community as a whole are upheld. As such, we're grateful to have had the opportunity to work with the Office of Community Developments Housing Programs Division, Mr. Cole, and the Community Land Trust Board over the past several years, to have a seat at the table and a collective voice regarding decisions about this property, and we feel that our voices and concerns are being heard at this level. At this point, we recognize there are a few design components that still need to be worked out including the finer details of onsite stormwater infrastructure and some potential concerns about traffic on Rear Coats Alley, which was mentioned. However, we have been impressed with the City's commitment to inclusion and collaboration on this project and have full confidence in this approach to the development process. We're also excited and proud about several key facets of this project including a standing commitment to a fuller thinking stormwater mitigation plan that will not only prevent added stress on our aging infrastructure but will also reflect the values of our community with regards to environmental quality and downstream impacts to neighbors. We're also excited about bringing in new neighbors who have a vested interest in their residences and our community. This project will bring improvements to our neighborhood, turning empty blighted lots into a path to home ownership while retaining a degree of public oversight from the Community Land Trust and the Office of Community Development. Additionally, this development will be a lasting legacy for its namesake, Dan Cullimore, who, I'm sure you're aware, was a kind and committed man to the causes of affordable housing, ecological integrity, and community empowerment. We feel confident that helping the current plan move forward with continued collaboration in the process will prove to be an asset to our community and City by improving property values and strengthening the neighborhood dynamic. So it's on these grounds that the North-Central Columbia Neighborhood Association supports the proposed plat before you and urges each of you to offer the same strong support when you vote this evening. Thank you for your time and consideration.

MS. LOE: Thank you. Are there any questions for this speaker? Mr. MacMann?

MR. MACMANN: Just a quick comment. I would like to thank the neighborhood for their long-term and realistic engagement on this process because they were really involved.

MS. LOE: Any additional questions? Thank you.

MS. HARGROVE: Hello. I'm Carrie Hargrove and I live at 1009 Coats Street. I can see the Rear Coats Street from my front door. I am in support of this neighborhood expansion. I think it will stabilize the neighborhood as previously mentioned, but I want to speak about one concern that we do have, which has also been vaguely mentioned, which is the traffic on Rear Coats, and I have a proposed option that we might be able to consider to mitigate any traffic issues. As said earlier, Rear Coats was just asphalted earlier this year. It's pretty narrow, and it runs in between Fairview and North Boulevard. I propose that Rear Coats becomes one way coming from Fairview and is shut off at North Boulevard so that traffic coming from those businesses on North Boulevard late at night won't clog up that street and propose some issues for the residents in the neighborhood and living on Rear Coats. Several years ago on North Boulevard, the City or the Planning and Zoning Commission, somebody put up no parking signs on one of the sides of the North Boulevard, and that reduced a lot of congestion on that street when the bars closed down and notably when Club Vogue closed. And so, the less people are in that neighborhood at that time of night, the less issues we've had with crime in our neighborhoods. So the -- if Rear Coats is widened and it's asphalted and it's more welcoming to more traffic coming from North Boulevard, we just are concerned that issues in our neighborhood that have been address -- been adequately addressed in the past might flare back up for residents of the neighborhood.

MS. LOE: Thank you. Mr. MacMann?

MR. MACMANN: Ms. Hargrove, just to be clear, you -- and please correct me if I'm wrong. You would be in favor of closing North Rear Coats where it hits North; is that what you said?

MS. HARGROVE: I -- I would say we could not allow access to Rear Coats from North Boulevard, so you couldn't drive south, I guess, on Rear Coats, from entering from North Boulevard. But the neighborhood -- the neighbors could drive into Rear Coats to get to their house that are on Rear Coats. But people that leaving the Thirsty Turtle and Club Vogue can't drive down --

MR. MACMANN: So however that happens, you would rather the traffic not come from North Boulevard south on Rear Coats?

MS. HARGROVE: Yes.

MR. MACMANN: All right. That's -- that's what I thought you said. Thank you very much.

MS. HARGROVE: Yeah.

MS. LOE: Any additional questions for this speaker? Question for staff. Have any modifications to the street been considered as part of this proposal?

MR. ZENNER: With the exception of the addition of five feet of right-of-way that would be dedicated and parking then that would be being provided within that additional dedicated right-of-way, there are none.

MS. LOE: None have been considered.

MR. ZENNER: None have been required.

MS. LOE: None have been required.

MR. ZENNER: The -- as Mr. Palmer pointed out, the existing pavement is 12 feet. The right-of-way is 15. Neither meet any roadway standard nor fire access. The necessity to be able to open up fire access at some point is contingent upon what happens to the south actually because of the existing development to where this speaker's home is located on the west side of the road. The functionality of the roadway is a two-way street today is, at best, probably limited and eventually, through consideration with our traffic engineering division, may be able to be signed as one way either today or at some point in the future should the issue arise again as this project is developed.

MS. LOE: Thank you. Any additional speakers?

MS. MAZE: Hi. My name is Susan Maze; I am a -- I live at 902 North Seventh Street, and I am the current president of the North-Central Neighborhood Association. The discussion around traffic on North Boulevard, Rear Coats has been fairly common discussion point in the neighborhood for the last several years. At the moment, and we do have concerns about traffic on North Boulevard since it was paved. We just woke up one day and it was paved. So part of what that discussion would be is we've been talking to Randy about some of those questions that we have. We haven't come to any decisions yet, but it is definitely part of our discussions.

MS. LOE: Thank you. Any questions for this speaker? Thank you, Ms. Maze. Any additional speakers?

MR. ELKIN: Eugene Elkin, 3406 Range Line. Some 30 years ago, I helped to bring Habitat for Humanity here. I'm the gentleman who put the Show-Me -- from the Show-Me Central 150-plus houses later. I can talk it, I do not build them. But we'll say in the late '90s, we now have a Habitat house if original owner is in it across the street from this proposed development. We have -- I've now got nine years working with the homeless. I'm part of the Wilkes Church. I have a family who was truly homeless. The children were taken. They now reside across from this development with children back in their -- as one whole family again which I say thank you, Lord. My purpose for standing up here, Mr. Cole clearly heard me say the neighborhood did not want the original plans of some property to be developed in the homeless shelter setting. I would hope in the future if anyone comes before you trying to get shelters for homeless, that out of that very meeting came the discussion of one for men, one for women, one for men with children, and one for women with children, four locations scattered across our City to help hold down drugs, alcohol, violence, police calls. I have talked about this several times since that meeting, and the homeless truly like that concept. They realize if everyone is congregated in one spot, we're asking for more trouble. Out of that very meeting, I was totally shocked as a member of that church what was being described going on in the backyards. Habitat's purpose is to come in with ownership and see improvement. As they sit here tonight, that is their ultimate goal. Give these people ownership and possibly we can see a future of the benefit -- less violence, less of the illegal goings on

that currently has been going on unbeknownst to us that are in that area all the time. I'm going to ask the buffer on the north end, are we looking at a fence? What are we looking at when we say a buffer?

MR. PALMER: It was just a vegetative buffer, a number of trees planted along the north property line.

MR. ELKIN: I would truly like to see that as a pure -- if it be a fence or whatever you desire, be a solid buffer because you're looking at everything the residents that live there speak of. They say, hey, we're worried about the traffic, the movement at 2:00, 3:00 in the morning, where all their wandering will have to wander all the way out to Eighth Street or all the way over to Coats unless you come up with some proposal to cut it off complete, which could be a benefit, to have no access to the boulevard. Point being everything I learned at that meeting, Mr. Cole will probably agree -- doesn't know what I'm talking about. It does go back a few years ago, I believe local school board member lady was in charge of that particular meeting. If Mr. Cole was not there, I am apologizing. I was under the impression he was there. But I'd be glad to get the name of the lady I'm speaking of, that she was in charge, and chose not to go forward. I am very impressed with the housing they currently have on the Lynn Street project. It has Habitat houses across from it. Again, I look forward to seeing this development. I did want to know where the south end of this is. Would anyone describe what is the south end?

MR. MACMANN: Mr. Elkin, if I may. The south end -- you know, the property that the neighborhood referred to as the "Church" with the turret.

MR. ELKIN: That red-looking --

MR. MACMANN: That brick and other structure, the property line between the church and that empty lot is the south terminus of that property.

MR. ELKIN: Thank you, and I hope to see more of this in the First Ward. Thank you.

MS. LOE: Thank you, Mr. Elkin. Are there any questions for this speaker? I see none. Any additional public comment? Seeing none, I'm going to close public comment.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

MS. LOE: Commission discussion? Mr. MacMann?

MR. MACMANN: Just real quick. Per Mr. Elkin's concern about the lights in the parking lot from Club Vogue, and Mr. Cole can correct me if I'm wrong. There will be a buffer there and the land trust will own the property. If there is a long-term problem with lighting and sound and stuff, they could improve the buffer if the community members so wish it to be improved.

MS. LOE: The lot directly north is also R-MF still?

MR. MACMANN: That is correct. The whole area is R-MF.

MS. LOE: Right. So there is not a buffer required between the R-1 or the PD and the R-MF that we would be -- it would be between the R-MF and the M-N.

MR. ZENNER: Yes. It would only be required -- a screening buffer would be required on the undeveloped R-MF property if it were multi-family. If it were one- or two-family, which is what this is proposed to be developed as, there is no buffer required. So it's multi-family on the vacant lot would

trigger a buffer on the vacant lot, which would, in essence, buffer out. So if this were being developed as multi-family, which it is not, so by definition, you would have a buffer -- you have a required buffer to the undeveloped R-MF.

MS. LOE: Thank you. Ms. Russell?

MS. RUSSELL: Would you like a motion?

MS. LOE: I would.

MS. RUSSELL: All right. In the case of 18-180, I move to approve the requested PD zoning and its accompanying Statement of Intent, as well as the PD Plan to be known as Cullimore Cottages PD Plan.

MR. STRODTMAN: Second.

MR. MACMANN: Second

MS. LOE: I'm going to give that second to Mr. Strodman. Ms. Burns, may we have a roll call?

MS. BURNS: Yes.

Roll Call Vote (Voting "yes" is to recommend approval.) Voting Yes: Mr. MacMann, Mr. Strodman, Ms. Russell, Ms. Burns, Ms. Loe, Mr. Harder. Motion carries 6-0.

MS. BURNS: Six to zero, motion carries.

MS. LOE: Thank you, Ms. Burns. Recommendation for approval will be forwarded to City Council.