

**AGENDA REPORT
PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING
November 10, 2022**

SUMMARY

A request by the Columbia Historic Preservation Commission (agent), on behalf of the City of Columbia (owner), seeking to establish a historic preservation overlay district including properties addressed as 910 and 912 E. Walnut, and designating both existing structures as historic landmarks. **(Case #9-2023)**

DISCUSSION

In April 2018, City Council requested input from the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) on the historic value and nature of the properties at 910 & 912 E. Walnut. The City's Solid Waste Division was finalizing a contract to purchase the property for use as a refuse and recycling collection site. The property was planned to be subdivided into two lots - one would house the Solid Waste collection site and the remainder of the property, which holds the existing structures, would be resold.

The report from the HPC was to include a recommendation for Council's consideration as to what protections should be placed on the structures, if any, while under City ownership. In May 2018, the HPC presented a letter of recommendation to City Council. That letter indicated, based on preliminary findings, the home at 910 E. Walnut was built and occupied by a local businessman, Cecil Fuller Crane, and his family. The home played many different roles throughout history, as a family home, a boarding house during the Great Depression, and later as student/workforce housing unit.

Upon examination of the 910 E. Walnut (Crane Building) the Commission noted the following **interior** elements as original and appropriate for regulation;

- Original fireplace,
- Stained glass window,
- French doors,
- Trim & moldings,
- Bannister, and
- Original mail-slot door.

Exterior elements the HPC wished to regulate included the following;

- Exterior facades of both buildings,
- Arched lintels and stone window sills on the Crane Building.

The building at 912 E. Walnut (Fischer Building), unfortunately, has been extensively modified on the interior and has few distinguishable elements on the outside. The Fischer Building appears to have been built circa 1930, and subsequently occupied by Dr. William O. Fischer, the brother to Sophia Bonner, who owned the property at the time and a local physician. Upon further examination of the property's provenance by local historian, Deb Sheals, both buildings were found to be linked to Mr. S.K. Cho, who is believed to be the first Korean student and graduate of the University of Missouri. Mr. Cho and his family occupied a portion of the home and the office for a short time beginning in 1940, before moving to accommodate their growing family.

The original recommendation by the HPC was that the City nominate both 910 & 912 E. Walnut for listing on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). However, at the October 5, 2021 meeting of the HPC, the Commission reviewed the two properties, noting that they likely do not meet the stringent NRHP standards. The Commission voted to recommend creation of a local Historic Preservation Overlay District (HP-O), recognizing both the Fischer Building and the Crane Building as local landmark historic structures, and regulating the above-named architectural features by applying restrictions on the deed for each property mirroring the proposed landmark regulations.

Local HP-O and landmark restrictions were written to reflect those of the NRHP. While the overlay offers only modest protections to general character and appearance, landmark status permits the regulation of interior elements of the buildings, such as the items listed for protection within the Crane Building. The Commission believes that the Fischer Building rises to the level of historical significance given its history and longevity, but the Crane Building maintains many original design elements, justifying the landmark designation and stringent regulation on both addresses.

Staff prepared a report to City Council, on behalf of the HPC, seeking authorization to pursue local landmark and HP-O district status for the subject properties. The report was read by Council at their January 3, 2022 meeting, after which Council directed the Commission to move forward with the request. Staff was instructed to prepare a petition for district and landmark status for approval by the HPC. Pursuant to Section 29-2.3(c)(5) of the UDC, the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council are required to take actions on the report prepared by the HPC prior to the designation of a property as a landmark or the establishment of an HP-O district. Section 29-2.3(c)(6) provides the specific criteria that must be met for structures to be designated as landmarks or an HP-O district.

The findings of the HPC relating to the subject properties, as summarized above, have been reviewed for compliance with the provisions of Section 29-2.3(c)(6) and are found to be substantially consistent with five of the twelve evaluation standards. Both properties have character, interest, or value as a part of the cultural characteristics of Columbia [29-2.3(c)(6), item (i)], and are identified with a person, or persons, who significantly contributed to the development of Columbia [item (iii)]. The property at 910 contains elements of design, detailing, materials, or craftsmanship which render it architecturally significant [item (vi)] and its unique location or physical characteristics make it an established or familiar visual feature in downtown [item (vii)]. The properties are also over 50 years of age [item(xii)].

The procedural provisions enumerated in Section 29-2.3(c)(5) have been met. City Council directed Staff to pursue landmark and district status as recommended by the HPC in their report to Council from early January. Staff prepared the petition form, which did not previously exist, and gained its approval by the Director of Community Development. The HPC reviewed the form at their March 2022 meeting and approved the form for use. Staff also completed the petition form seeking the landmark and district designations for 910 and 912 E. Walnut, and the HPC reviewed the petition by the City. This report was subsequently prepared by staff, on behalf of the HPC, and incorporates their original recommendation as well as their findings subsequent to the 2018 letter to Council, including their determination that the properties likely do not qualify for NRHP listing. However, while NRHP standards are highly selective, the local designation standards are intentionally broad.

Pursuant to these provisions, the recommendations provided below were presented for the Historic Preservation Commission's consideration and are consistent with the authority granted to them by the UDC in designating and establishing landmark structures and HP-O districts, respectively.

RECOMMENDATION BY THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

- Approval of the proposed zoning map amendment, placing the properties at 910 & 912 E. Walnut, to be known as the C.F. Crane Building (910) and the William O. Fischer Building (912), within a Historic Preservation Overlay District (HP-O).
- Approval of the designation of both 910 & 912 E. Walnut as local historic landmark structures.
- Approval of the proposed landmark restrictions regulating the removal or modification of exterior elements of both 910 & 912 E. Walnut as well as the named interior elements of 910 E. Walnut as detailed in the “Petition for Historic Landmark & District Designation” and summarized above.
- Approval of the proposed deed restrictions regulating the removal or modification of exterior elements of both 910 & 912 E. Walnut as well as the named interior elements of 910 E. Walnut as detailed in the “Petition for Historic Landmark & District Designation” and summarized above.

SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS (ATTACHED)

- Locator maps
- Designation Petition
- Site and Historic Element Photos
- HPC Report (November 2022)
- HPC Minute Excerpts (June 2022)
- Findings of Fact Report (May 2022)
- PZC Minute Excerpts (March 2022)
- Staff Report to HPC (September 2021)
- HPC Recommendation (May 2018)
- Council Minute Excerpts (April 16, 2018), January 3, 2022 not available

SITE CHARACTERISTICS

Area (acres)	0.07 acres
Topography	Flat
Vegetation/Landscaping	None, developed
Watershed/Drainage	Perche Creek
Existing structures	Two buildings on north end frontage, currently vacant. Approximate southern half of lot used for solid waste recycling & collection purposes.

HISTORY

Annexation date	1826
Zoning District	M-DT (Mixed-Use Downtown)
Land Use Plan designation	Commercial
Previous Subdivision/Legal Lot Status	Legal Lot

UTILITIES & SERVICES

All public utilities and services provided by the City of Columbia.

ACCESS

Walnut Street	
Location	Along the North side of property
Major Roadway Plan	Local, non-residential
CIP projects	None
Sidewalk	Sidewalks constructed.

PARKS & RECREATION

Neighborhood Parks	None within half-mile.
Trails Plan	None
Bicycle/Pedestrian Plan	None

PUBLIC NOTIFICATION

All property owners within 200 feet and City-recognized neighborhood associations within 1,000 feet of the boundaries of the subject property were notified of this pending request - 25 property owner letters were distributed. A public hearing ad was placed in the Columbia Daily Tribune on October 25, 2022.

Report prepared by Rusty Palmer

Approved by Patrick Zenner