



Department Source: Community Development - Planning

To: City Council

From: City Manager & Staff

Council Meeting Date: December 5, 2022

Re: 910 & 912 E. Walnut Street - Historic Landmark and HP-O District Designation (Case # 09-2023)

Executive Summary

Approval of this request would amend the City Zoning map by establishing a HP-O (Historic Preservation Overlay) zoning district on the properties located at 910 & 912 E. Walnut Street and designating the structures located on at those addresses as historic landmarks.

Discussion

In April 2018, City Council requested input from the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) on the historic value and nature of the properties at 910 & 912 E. Walnut given their pending acquisition by the City's Solid Waste Division for use as a solid waste refuse and recycling collection site. At that time the property was planned to be subdivided into two lots - one would house the solid waste collection site and the remainder of the property, which holds the existing structures, was to be resold.

The report from the HPC was to include a recommendation for Council's consideration as to what protections should be placed on the structures, if any, while under City ownership. In May 2018, the HPC presented a letter of recommendation to City Council. In the letter preliminary findings by the HPC indicated that the home at 910 E. Walnut was built and occupied by a local businessman, Cecil Fuller Crane, and his family. The home played many different roles throughout history, as a family home, a boarding house during the Great Depression, and later as student/workforce housing. The Fischer Building, 912 E. Walnut, appears to have been built circa 1930, and subsequently occupied by Dr. William O. Fischer, the brother to Sophia Bonner, who owned the property at the time and a local physician.

Upon further examination of each building's provenance by local historian Deb Sheals, it was determined that both buildings were linked to Mr. S.K. Cho, who is believed to be the first Korean student and graduate of the University of Missouri. Mr. Cho and his family occupied a portion of the home and the office for a short time beginning in 1940, before moving to accommodate their growing family.

Upon touring the Crane Building (910 E. Walnut) the Commission noted a number of interior elements such as the original fireplace, French doors, trim, bannister, and an original mail-slot door were still intact. The HPC also identified several exterior elements that it wished to protect which included the facades of both buildings, generally, and the arched lintels, and stone sills that frame the window openings in the Crane Building. The Fischer Building (912 E. Walnut), unfortunately, has been extensively modified on the interior and has few distinguishable elements on the outside.



City of Columbia

701 East Broadway, Columbia, Missouri 65201

The original recommendation by the HPC was that the City nominate both 910 & 912 E. Walnut for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. However, at their October 5, 2021 meeting the two properties were re-reviewed and the Commission voted instead to recommend creation of a local Historic Preservation Overlay District (HP-O), recognizing both the Fischer Building and the Crane Building as local landmark historic structures, and creating deed restrictions for each property to mirror the proposed landmark regulations.

The local Columbia HP-O and landmark restrictions were written to mirror those of the NRHP (National Register of Historic Places). While the overlay offers only modest protections, the landmark status permits the regulation of interior elements of the buildings, such as the items the HPC listed for protection within the Crane Building. The Commission believes that both buildings meet a number of the established evaluation criteria for historic designations found in Section 29-2.3(c)(6) of the UDC, and as such, rise to the level of historical significance justifying the proposed protections. The Commission's findings are detailed in the attached Planning Commission staff report and designation petition.

The Planning & Zoning Commission considered this request at their November 10, 2022 meeting. Staff presented their report and Commissioners inquired about the arrangements for provision of public sewer to the property, and questioned the exterior restrictions for 912 E. Walnut given the lack of significant architectural elements on the façade. Staff indicated that the sewer lateral in place serves both structures and given its location generally lying beneath the adjacent structure to the east its replacement to a different location would potentially damage the adjoining building. Given this condition, the original two lot plat was not possible as it would create a "common-collector" sewer situation. In regards to the exterior restrictions proposed for 912 E. Walnut, Commissioner McMann indicated that the restrictions were proposed by the HPC as a means of restricting the demolition of the structure.

After limited further discussion, Commissioners made the following motions:

- Designate 910 & 912 E. Walnut Street as local historic landmarks – approved (8-0).
- Revise the City Zoning Map, establishing a Historic Preservation Overlay (HP-O) district on the subject property - approved (8-0).
- Apply the proposed landmark property restrictions, regulating components of both structures as detailed in the designation petition (attached) and staff report – approved (8-0).
- Apply the proposed deed restrictions on the subject property, mirroring the proposed landmark property restrictions – approved (8-0). (It should be noted that the deed restrictions would be prepared and attached to any future property conveyance of either 910 or 912 E. Walnut)

The Planning and Zoning Commission staff report, locator maps, designation petition, application supporting documents, and meeting minutes are attached for review.

Upon review of the recommendations from the commissions, the staff have reservations about the recommended restrictions on the building interior. Requiring preservation of the



several interior elements further constrains a property that already has a number of constraints on its reuse. Unless the structures remain public buildings open to the general public, there is not a public benefit comparable to the preservation of the exterior.

Fiscal Impact

Short-Term Impact: None anticipated

Long-Term Impact: None anticipated

Strategic & Comprehensive Plan Impact

Strategic Plan Impacts:

Primary Impact: Reliable Infrastructure, Secondary Impact: Resilient Economy, Tertiary Impact: Not Applicable

Comprehensive Plan Impacts:

Primary Impact: Infrastructure, Secondary Impact: Economic Development, Tertiary Impact: Livable & Sustainable Communities

Legislative History

Date	Action
5/21/18	Authorized the contract for the acquisition of property located at 910/912 East Walnut Street, to be used by the Solid Waste Division for a collection site for refuse, cardboard and container recycling in the Downtown CID; appropriating funds. B 72-18
4/16/18	Tabled to allow Historic Preservation Commission review. B 72-18

Suggested Council Action

The Commission recommends approval of the establishment of HP-O zoning upon the property containing the addresses of 910 & 912 E. Walnut, designate the structures addressed as 910 & 912 E. Walnut as historic landmarks, approve historic landmark restrictions as outlined in the “designation petition”, and approve use of landmark restrictions as deed restrictions to be reflected in future conveyances of either 910 or 912 E. Walnut, as recommended by the Planning and Zoning Commission. Staff does not recommend the approval of the restrictions on the interior elements.