

EXCERPTS
PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING
COLUMBIA CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBER
701 EAST BROADWAY, COLUMBIA, MO
November 20, 2025

Case Number 11-2026

A request by Paula Clayton (agent), on behalf of Jennifer Hempel and Paula Clayton (owners), to allow 411 McBaine Avenue to be used as a 210-night maximum of six guests short-term rental (STR) pursuant to Section 29-3.3(vv) and Section 29-6.4(m)(2) of the Unified Development Code. The three-bedroom, two bathroom home has an attached one-car garage and driveway capacity to support one UDC-compliant on-site parking space. If the application is approved, the applicant will need to install one additional UDC-compliant parking space in order to accommodate the requested six guests. Until the parking space is installed, the maximum number of guests the property can support is four. The 0.20-acre subject site is located on the west side of McBaine Avenue, approximately 35 feet south of its intersection with Lincoln Drive.

MS. GEUEA JONES: May we please have a staff report?

Staff report was given by Mr. Ross Halligan of the Planning and Development Department. Staff recommends approval of the conditional use permit to allow 411 McBaine Avenue to be operated as a STR subject to:

1. The maximum occupancy shall not exceed four transient guests regardless of occupancy allowed by the most recently adopted edition of the International Property Maintenance Code (IPMC) until one additional UDC-compliant parking space has been added to the site allowing the dwelling to be then used for a maximum of six guests;
2. A maximum of 210 nights of annual usage;
3. The attached one-car garage shall be made available while the dwelling is in STR use.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you. Before we go to questions for staff, if any of my fellow Commissioners have had any contact with parties to this case outside of a public hearing, please disclose so now. Seeing none. Questions for staff? I had one question. This is not the applicant's primary residence?

MR. HALLIGAN: No, it is not.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Do we know if it's -- and it doesn't have a rental certificate; is that right?

MR. HALLIGAN: That is correct.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Okay. Thank you. I think that's all -- Commissioner Ortiz?

MS. ORTIZ: Can you speak to whether this was built as part of an affordable housing initiative? Do you know anything about that?

MR. HALLIGAN: I'm not aware of that, but that is -- was noted in that one letter of opposition, if you -- that you have access to, but I do not know the background on this history of this area.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Mr. Zenner, do you recall?

MR. ZENNER: I do not. I know who the former property owner was, and I don't believe it was built using an affordable housing initiative process, but I don't have direct -- I don't have direct information to support that it was offered a fee reduction or something of that nature.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Okay. Thank you. Any other questions for staff? Seeing -- oh, I'm so sorry. Commissioner Stanton, please?

MR. STANTON: If an additional parking space were to be provided, how and where?

MR. HALLIGAN: I believe the standard is they cannot take up 30 percent of the front yard or 500 feet, the greater of the two, so it couldn't be greater than 500 square feet, the combined driveway or 30 percent of the front yard.

MR. ZENNER: Basically, based on the photography that was provided, it would be to the south of the existing driveway.

MR. STANTON: Between the two houses, cut off to the side?

MR. ZENNER: So it would be to the -- to the left side of the existing drive that is here today. And it would also be a required driveway approach expansion which would require proper City permitting to do so.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any other questions? I have a question for legal. With these CUP requests, we can -- we can make modifications. Correct? Or do we have to take them or leave them as presented by staff?

MR. CRAIG: You're not referring to criteria, you're just talking about to any sort of --

MS. GEUEA JONES: The conditions.

MR. CRAIG: Oh, yes. There is -- yeah, this Commission does have a right to do that.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Yeah. So we -- we could say for a period and that's it?

MR. CRAIG: Yes.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Okay. Thank you. I just wanted to clarify that we weren't limited. I know on some cases we are.

MR. CRAIG: As long as it doesn't run afoul of the ordinance as written. I mean, we can't -- (inaudible).

MS. GEUEA JONES: Certainly. Certainly, yeah. Commissioner Stanton?

MR. STANTON: And to piggy back on that, so that would be a conversation between the owner up here to say they want us to vote it as it is, or vote our potential recommendation. How will we do that?

MR. CRAIG: I mean, that conversation could be had with the applicant, see if there could be -- yeah.

MR. STANTON: All right. Okay. That's what I wanted to know. Okay.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any other -- Commissioner Walters?

MR. WALTERS: Also I have a question for you for legal. Could -- would it be -- is there any history of a -- projects like suggested in the opposition letter of restricting the use here. Could there be

any deed restrictions or covenants that could preclude or disallow this to be used as -- as being requested tonight? Is it possible? I'm not asking do you know if it's relevant, but is it possible?

MR. CRAIG: I don't believe so. I've never heard of such a thing. If there are, I mean, that's -- if -- if that wasn't in, I believe, the -- the deed would have been submitted with the application. Correct?

MR. ZENNER: Yes, it would have been. I mean, but a deed restriction is not something that the City would generally be enforcing.

MR. CRAIG: And, yeah. That's also --

MR. WALTERS: Okay.

MR. CRAIG: Mr. Zenner is correct on that.

MR. WALTERS: All right. Thank you.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Mr. Stanton?

MR. STANTON: My experience is this. I'm not 200 percent sure about this house. If Job Point didn't build it, I think someone else did. And so if the original owner, there would be a time frame in which that person has to live in the home, blah, blah, blah. If it changes hands and ownership, you know, as long as they stay with it, I think it may be five, ten years, whatever. I'm -- I'm almost willing to bet this is like a Job Point or a school home, or something like that at one time. Now for them to come about now, I think that time may have expired.

MR. CRAIG: Okay.

MR. STANTON: So that's that. I couldn't get an exact answer. I was trying to get an answer if that was a --

MS. GEUEA JONES: I believe it -- I believe it was, Commissioner Stanton, a Job Point home at one point, based on deed records. Okay. Any other questions for staff or seeking clarification from legal? Seeing none. We will go to public comment. Any members of the public who wish to come forward, please come forward. You guys have got to fight it out. Let's go. Come on. Somebody, anybody. Name and address for the record, and get as close to that microphone as you feel comfortable.

MS. CLAYTON: Especially with a mask on, aye?

MS. GEUEA JONES: Yes.

MS. CLAYTON: My name is Paula Clayton, so I am representing Jenny, my wife, and I are the applicants for this, and, yes, it was a Job Point. And then the previous owner has lived there since 2011, and I don't know that he was there much because he had absolutely not much in the way of gas or electric bills. We would like to do the four applicants. We were doing the driveway thing. I think, Mr. Zenner, you had -- had suggested that as a just in case, even if we don't go ahead and do it, but get the -- so it would save doing another meeting and another application process later on if we did decide to -- (inaudible). Yeah. We'd like to be here as soon as possible.

MR. CRAIG: Ms. Clayton, two things. Could you state your address for the record for --

MS. CLAYTON: Oh, I'm sorry. Yes. Address is 411 McBaine Avenue. I've been coming back and forth doing stuff on the house.

MR. CRAIG: And, secondly, could you get a little bit closer to the mic so we can make an accurate record here?

MS. CLAYTON: Oh, I'm sorry. Yes.

MR. CRAIG: Thank you.

MS. CLAYTON: And home address is 3653 North Laramie Avenue, Chicago, Illinois, 60641.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you. Commissioner Stanton, go ahead.

MR. STANTON: Yeah. But you -- you don't live at 411 McBaine?

MR. CLAYTON: I live at 411? No. I live in Chicago.

MR. STANTON: Okay. Okay.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah. Want to keep coming back here because we want to retire here. Five to ten years, hopefully two years, I think, but if we keep coming back, we get used -- we get used to community. We've got family here. We spend more time here, you know. We see how the house is -- we did the Airbnb because we didn't want it to be empty, and -- but we don't want it to be -- we can't come back and live there and adjust, you know, to the idea.

MR. ZENNER: Yeah.

MS. CLAYTON: Jenny, my wife, she's a teacher. Oh, the other thing was with the fence thing, I did call Rebecca today and -- sorry. Nervous in front of people.

MS. GEUEA JONES: You're okay.

MS. CLAYTON: She -- the Beck neighbor and we -- she has a neighbor who does fencing, and she's going to get a quote from him, so we'll split costs with that. So, yeah.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Other questions for this speaker? I have a question. Have you ever done any of this Airbnb kind of business before?

MS. CLAYTON: No. No. It's a complete new thing, but our co-host Jessica, she has, so will do what she says with, you know, we need to do this, you don't need to do that, you know.

MS. GEUEA JONES: I understand, yeah.

MS. CLAYTON: Oh. I have also talked to the neighbors either side who are both renting, Kristen on the south, and I think his name is Conner and Emily on the north. They're both okay, but I didn't get them to call. And they've got my phone number so that if there's anybody who is a twit who is there, and they're in the -- (inaudible) -- so they can contact us, as well, and we can get ahold of -- (inaudible) -- just so we -- yeah.

MS. GEUEA JONES: My other question -- oh. If -- sorry. It's been a long, long day.

MS. CLAYTON: Uh-huh.

MS. GEUEA JONES: But the front yard is quite small. If we said you could only have four guests at a time, would that be okay with you?

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah. Yeah.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Just so your whole front yard is not --

MS. CLAYTON: Oh, no. Yeah. It doesn't appeal to me, either. I like gardening and I like

growing things, so yeah.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Okay. Any other questions? Commissioner Walters?

MR. WALTERS: I think I missed this, but where -- where is a person who gets a phone call in case there's an issue here?

MS. CLAYTON: Jessica.

MR. WALTERS: And how close do you live -- I may have missed this.

MS. CLAYTON: Oh, I'm sorry.

MR. WALTERS: Where does the agent, the person responsible for it, where does she live?

MS. SIMPSON: I live by Macadoodles, so -- (inaudible).

MS. GEUEA JONES: We can't -- could you -- could you state where she lives for us?

MS. CLAYTON: She lives by Macadoodles, about three and a half miles away, I think.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you. Appreciate that.

MR. WALTERS: Okay. All right. Thank you.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any other questions for this speaker? Commissioner Stanton?

MR. STANTON: Are you German, by chance?

MS. CLAYTON: New Zealand, no.

MR. STANTON: New Zealand. Okay. Okay. I got the accent wrong.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: I was going to spit some German to you, but okay.

MS. CLAYTON: I can do an imitation --

MR. STANTON: This is the -- this is my biggest issue.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: Biggest.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: Number one, this is in my neighborhood.

MS. CLAYTON: Okay.

MR. STANTON: Number two, I think I have built this house. Really. Really.

MS. CLAYTON: Listen. Listen. Can I grill you later --

MR. STANTON: And the neighborhood is historic.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah. As this one.

MR. STANTON: And I'm not opposed to it being used as a short-term rental. But my fear is you're a rookie at it.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: Which is a beginner, a novice, and you -- and you're endeavor for me to get a vote, a yes vote, have to convince me that you have all your bases covered if we were to allow it to be a short-term rental, you know. So --

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah. Fair.

MR. STANTON: So I need to know, like my colleague asked, stuff -- she stole my question, so I'm going to say it again.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: If the stuff hits the fan and I need to call somebody, who do I call and how fast are they going to get there?

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: That's --

MS. CLAYTON: Can I get Jessica up here? She really wants to come up --

MR. STANTON: Yeah. After we -- after we talk to you.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: So I need to be convinced of those things. I need to be convinced of I am only going to support this if it's only four because I do not want the additional concrete. That's my point of view.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: My opinion. My vote is if I've come to a four transient guests, and it's going to be maintained.

MS. CLAYTON: Uh-huh.

MR. STANTON: You're going to have a strong rental policy. I mean, I need to be convinced you have all these ducks in a row. That's what I need.

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah. Yeah. I like the Eco thing, too, so I really want to do the -- yeah. Doing things around there, like it's a -- you know how you have Airbnb things and there like a theme, so I think, oh, eco, gardening, all that, which the whole thing of having another driveway doesn't really appeal except for the, hey, make the ends meet with the bills. But that -- you know, as far as bills go, that -- that appeals. But, yeah. Jessica for the -- the thing onto it. Is that -- so it would be the -- no concrete and better be on top of stuff when it happens.

MR. STANTON: I'm still open to hear more stuff.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any -- oh, I'm sorry.

MR. STANTON: No, I'm done.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any other questions? That's one -- I'm sorry. We're not trying to beat you up. How -- how often are you down here?

MS. CLAYTON: I don't know. We've got family in -- in town, so this means we -- we now want to come here and do more vacations with them and be here. I want to be here as much as I can. I'm more ready to retire than Jenny does. She's got a job that she loves. She's a teacher, and, yeah.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Okay. Thank you.

MS. CLAYTON: I don't know.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Just curious. Any other questions? Commissioner Ortiz?

MS. ORTIZ: Do you think that any of your family here in Columbia would be willing to be your

designated agent in the future?

MS. CLAYTON: Yeah. But I think Jessica is probably a better one to be, because she's got the experience and she's more like --

MS. ORTIZ: Oh, okay.

MS. CLAYTON: She's got the experience and connections. She knows what she's doing. She's all good with the, oh yeah, we'll get right on to it, yeah.

MS. ORTIZ: Okay.

MS. CLAYTON: Whereas family is -- they're doing their own jobs. It would be. uh, you know, it's something else they have to deal with.

MS. ORTIZ: Okay.

MS. CLAYTON: So I'd rather have the one who does it is her scene, than somebody who, oh, yeah, I'm really connected to you, and now you're going to resent me for it. Thank you.

MS. ORTIZ: Fair enough. Yeah.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Anyone else? Seeing none. Thank you so much.

MS. CLAYTON: Okay. Thank you.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Next speaker on this case, please come forward.

MR. FALBY: Hello. I'm Dan.

MS. GEUEA JONES: We need -- start with your name and address for the record into the microphone, please?

MR. FALBY: I'm Ben Falby; and I live at 407 McBaine, which is, like, two houses down from that one. I did -- I did e-mail you, and it was a -- it was a pleasant exchange. I -- you know, you all bought the house. Paula, you bought the house. I'm expecting Paula to be my neighbor at some point, so this needs to go well for me. If there weren't a sign in front of the house right now, I don't think I would have come, to be honest with you. But I thought about it more and it was built by Job Point. You did help build it. I've lived in Columbia and in that neighborhood for about 20 years now. I don't have rights to it like you do probably -- actually, definitely. But, you know, I'm rather partial to the neighborhood at this point. Because there's a sign up front, you are telling us that apparently we have a community level stake in how this space is used. And because of that, we have to make a decision about whether we want this to be used in this way. Right? So three houses south of me, Carmelita, Ray, and Summer are moving away because they can't rent out on my block anymore. All right? And they can't rent on the block anymore because the houses are going away. Now, Carmelita's mother-in-law lives two more blocks west of that, and now Summer can't see her grandma as frequently. That has nothing to do with this. Right? But it does get at a bigger problem, which is when we turn our affordable housing, which we built that -- we built that. When we turn this into a space like that, we're putting downward pressure on this community to try to find a place to live, and we are struggling. We all know we're struggling here related to homelessness, and it just pushing it down. And I would love to have somebody living there, hey, maybe Carmelita, Ray and Summer, I don't know. But if it's going to five, ten years before my new good

neighbor moves in, let's just keep it there so that some other family can live there in the meantime. I mean, like, it's strange to me that we decided as a community we wanted to build something so that these people could live in the central city, and then we go around and turn into we're, like, getting rid of that. It's ironic, like, I don't know. Yeah. I have missed my job twice in the evenings teaching GED classes in the last seven years. I got a sub tonight, so I don't know. You guys got any questions for me?

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any questions for this speaker? Commissioner Stanton?

MR. STANTON: Ben, how are you doing, sir?

MR. FALBY: What's up?

MR. STANTON: I completely agree with everything you said. I also agree that the owner has a right to use their property. Now if they have reached the statute of limitations of our build, our Job Point build, and they're supposed to stay there for five or ten years and they can sell it. This is kind of the nightmare that we all looked for.

MR. FALBY: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: You know, like, dang, we build affordable housing and in five years it could be back in the situation that we're trying to prevent, you know. That's happening.

MR. FALBY: I mean, I can say five or ten years ago when it was built, we didn't anticipate this situation.

MR. STANTON: Yes, You're correct.

MR. FALBY: Because this happened after the advent of internet services that allow you to do such a thing. So I -- I don't think we thought this could happen at all when this built.

MR. STANTON: Right.

MR. FALBY: In fact, the way affordable housing has been approached in town, it's changed dramatically; you know, land trust and what not. I don't know if the City would support the model that created that house in the first place. It is painful, though, to know the intent, to know the community this well, to know that money can be made off of this property. I'm certainly not against investment. I'm not. And I'm not against the right -- you know, like, this sounds like a way that you're going to plan for your future, and that makes sense to me. Right? But it doesn't have to be like this. You guys get to choose that. You've got to -- you've got to be the ones responsible for that.

MR. STANTON: Oh. So are you opposed to short-term rentals, period, or just here?

MR. FALBY: Oof. No. No. Because it's just too much of a -- too big of a blanket. I can't do that. I'm here about 411 McBaine. You know, I'm here about Debbie, my neighbor to the south, Carmelita, my former neighbor, four doors to the south. Tim lives in there, you know, a door, you know, north of that. No, I can't go there. I'm just talking about here. I'm talking about the history of that property. I'm talking about this story. The story I just happen to know really well.

MR. STANTON: Thank you.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Commissioner Ortiz, and then Commissioner Darr?

MS. ORTIZ: Would you tell me about 411 McBaine from, like, an infrastructure point of view, not,

like, not from the housing, but, like, tell me about the property and, like, what makes that spot not a good space for a short-term rental, in your opinion.

MR. FALBY: My students have to move north of town now because there isn't a place to live in the central city. And this place is in the middle of town. Right? You don't need the resources you need in the middle of town. You don't need those same resources. You don't have to find those resources when you live in the middle of town. I'm talking -- thinking, like, how the bus line works. I'm thinking about the proximity to Aldi's, Gerbes, the Business Loop, just everything. It's -- it's still relatively walkable. And so it's bizarre that -- again, we will be effectively pushing some family out of that opportunity. Right? And let's say it's not the family I have in mind. The movement of any family then pushes another family just further north or further east; right -- which is what's happened. That's what's happened in this town. And this is -- this is how it happens, so I don't know. Does that answer your question?

MS. ORTIZ: Not really.

MR. FALBY: Oh, okay.

MS. ORTIZ: So there's only certain criteria that we really can look at when we're looking at a short-term rental conditional use permit.

MR. FALBY: Sure.

MS. ORTIZ: And what you're griping about --

MR. FALBY: I mean, if you're asking about parking, I don't care about parking, man. Like honestly, the block to the west of me put in speed bumps because they can afford to spend the time to create speed bumps. My block, you know what the speed bumps are? It's the cars, you know. So, it's not a --

MS. ORTIZ: So what I'm hearing is, you have a problem with people speeding on your block?

MR. FALBY: Yeah.

MS. ORTIZ: And if there --

MR. FALBY: Actually, my car has been hit twice, but --

MS. ORTIZ: And what else is on your block that might --

MR. FALBY: You mean, a day care, during the day?

MS. ORTIZ: Okay. There's a day care.

MR. FALBY: Yeah. There's a day care. There's a day care that -- I don't know. It serves probably 50 to 70 kids.

MS. ORTIZ: And would -- again, I --

MR. FALBY: I don't know where you're going with this. I mean, I can tell you everything you want to know. I know about the footprint in the driveway. That footprint was left by a Youthbuild student who helped build it, like, they never sanded off the paint. I mean, I don't know. I can tell you anything you want to know about the place. But I don't -- you know. I mean, my big objection is straight up related to affordable housing and its availability, certainly not to making money. It's -- you know, I -- I get that, you know. In fact, if you want to move sooner, I would be thrilled, but this is -- this is not how we want to do

this.

MS. ORTIZ: Thank you.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Commissioner Darr?

MR. DARR: I'm just kind of following up with what you said. Do you believe there's adequate parking on the street? Is there -- do you find yourself not being able to find a place to park?

MR. FALBY: Well, it's funny. So you mentioned Kirsten who lives to the south, so Tyler owns the house. He's the one who sent the parking complaint. So -- so he's concerned about parking. I don't know. Am I concerned about parking? Sure. I don't know. I'm in -- that's a hard one for me. I don't care about parking. This is not a NIMBY thing for me. This is like a -- it's just not. It's not a NIMBY thing. I mean, I double park, like sometimes I pull out a car to pull in a car. Like, sometimes Debbie parks in my driveway a little bit, so does her son. I don't know. Like, I ain't worried about parking, but I know you all are, but I'm not. I ain't worried about that. So --

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any other questions? Commissioner Walters?

MR. WALTERS: I think it's maybe useful to point out that -- and just as you're talking about some of your neighbors being displaced because rent is rising, don't you assume the same thing would happen here? If this were a long-term rental, chances are the rent here would go up, and there still would be issues for people's affordability.

MR. FALBY: Yes. However, there would be one more place for a person to live who actually wants to be in Columbia right now, and that does have cascading effects.

MR. WALTERS: Well, I agree with that.

MR. FALBY: So you're right.

MR. WALTERS: I would agree with that.

MR. FALBY: It would push up the rent just by having -- like, that's just the course of time.

MR. WALTERS: But --

MR. FALBY: But again, what pushes up housing prices and rental prices? It's the amount of housing stock. And every time we'll slap an STR label on this, and we're going to do it sometimes. You asked me if I was just opposed outright? I don't know if I am. I've never been here before. But that's what we're doing. Like, we are going to make it slightly more difficult for people who intend to live here to find a place which will -- it just keeps pushing.

MR. WALTERS: It's kind of a macro argument which the -- which this Commission has dealt with for years, and now it's also -- we were pointing out that some of the people who use STRs are not tourists and they're not here for three days.

MR. FALBY: Yeah.

MR. WALTERS: Sometimes they're here for weeks or months --

MR. FALBY: Uh-huh.

MR. WALTERS: -- and sometimes they're here because they're going to be two or three months.

MR. FALBY: You're right.

MR. WALTERS: And so, anyway, I just think we need to broaden our ideas of what could happen here, and it is a problem. Affordable housing certainly is a problem, and I'm not trying to dismiss it, but I just think it's a -- maybe unfair to load that all onto this property here and have it dominate the discussion. That's my opinion.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any other questions? Commissioner Stanton?

MR. STANTON: My colleagues' points are valid, but definitely a big issue. These -- Mr. Falby is right across the board, and it's -- you can never -- it -- I'm not opposed to it being an STR myself. I'm not. Because it -- to me, it goes back to my original argument when we started this whole conversation. This isn't a building for somebody who owns a piece of property to make an extra buck, and increase family wealth. I -- my vote will depend on if I trust the system behind it to make it still a good place in my neighborhood. If I'm not convinced that the agent or the system that is in place to watch this STR and protect the interests of all the neighbors and all the fears that -- if that -- if I'm not convinced of that, I will vote no, but it's not the principle of their right to do so. It's do I have faith that it will be done in a way that will not put a smile on Mr. Falby's face, but we will equally be ticked off, which is a perfect compromise. So that's where I'm at.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Anyone else? Thank you for being here tonight. I appreciate it. You're -- you're good. Thank you. Next, please come forward. Name and address for the record.

MS. BANKS: My name is Barbie Banks; I live at 215 West Ash, which is just down the street from this one. I also sent an e-mail to Paula and Jenny, and I don't think there is probably much that you can do as Commissioners to not push this forward, so my message is more to Paula and Jenny to reconsider and pull this application and make this a long-term rental for a family. A three bedroom, two bath space in this area in our neighborhood is really hard to find for people. And so I'm pulling at your heart strings, at your sense of social justice. Withdraw this application and make it a long-term rental for five or ten years. That's all I have to say.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you. Are there any questions for this speaker? Commissioner Ortiz?

MS. ORTIZ: Do you know anything about this property that would make it not a good candidate to be a short-term rental?

MS. BANKS: Other than it -- just how it's moving somebody outside of the central city. So I don't think there's probably anything under what the -- what you, as Commissioners, can do that would make it not a -- I mean, I think, legally, it's probably there. Ethically, I don't think it should be a short-term rental.

MS. ORTIZ: Thank you.

MS. BANKS: Yeah.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Anyone else? Seeing none. Thank you for being here, Ms. Banks. Next speaker, come forward.

MS. DOKKEN: Dee Dokken, 804 Again Street. Yeah, it would be great if it was a long-term rental. And even though it's not 300 feet from a licensed short-term rental, I think 200 block of McBaine

has two -- at least two, so it is pretty dense there, and what a great neighborhood. I didn't realize these people were neighbors there. But the reason I came here is I was upset with the -- I didn't know about the history of the house, but upset with the extra driveway, extra concrete. And it looks like everyone is on the same page with that, so I'm very glad that if it is a short-term rental, it would be for four people. Thank you.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you, Ms. Dokken. Any questions? No? Thanks, Dee. Anyone else to speak on this case, please come forward. Normally, I say only one person at the podium at a time, but we'll make an exception in this case.

MS. SIMPSON: Hi. I'm Jessica Simpson; I reside at 652 Hunt Ridge Drive. And I will be the host on Paula and Jenny's property. I am a realtor, so they contacted me. Actually, they had another realtor. They contacted me through Airbnb and -- because there's, like a thing that you can, like, reach out if you want someone to host your property. And so, they were, like, hey, we have a realtor in Columbia that we've been, like, talking to, but we want you to manage our property once we get one. And I would say, okay, well, I'm also a realtor actually, so what kind of are you looking for in a property? And so they told me some of their, like, requirements, and I was, like, okay, I know exactly what neighborhood we need to look at. We need to look at West Ash because they are -- Paula is an artist. Jenny is a teacher. They want to be able to walk to the Farmer's Market. They want to be able to just, like, be on foot as much as possible. And so I was, like, I just knew, being familiar with Columbia, that this is going to be the neighborhood that they were happiest in. And I -- maybe I'm speaking, like, for her, but, huh, it does feel like nervous up here. But ever -- when I -- when I -- the whole time I've been talking to them, they told me they would retire in about two years, so I've never heard anything about five to ten years. And we closed -- I can't even remember. I kind of still have, like, pregnancy brain, I think, but we closed on the house -- it's been at least a couple months or beginning of October, I guess, actually. And they were kind of, like, we would love to Columbia for Thanksgiving with our family. Can we wait? And I was, like, we can wait until March if you want to. Like, I'm not in any rush. I'm not pushing you. Like, this is your property. You -- this is the point. This is why you want to do this is because you -- and I told them, I said, if we need to wait two years to find the perfect property, like, we need to find the perfect one. I'm not a realtor who is just, like, I don't just sell people houses to make money. Like, I sell people houses to help them build a life. And I know I actually kind of -- we looked at properties all over Columbia, and I had a feeling. I was, like, I think this is the one. Like, I think you're going to be so happy here, and this is where you're going to want to live. And we walked away from it. No one put it under contract. So there was plenty of time for other people to put this property under contract. If one of the neighbors wanted to live there, there was plenty of time. And that did not happen, and so it kind of, like, they almost gave up. And Jenny was, like, can you, like, it would be great if we found a house for my birthday. And I was, like, well, McBaine is still there, and I was, like, I'm surprised, because it was so affordable. And I was, like, this is really going to be the perfect house for you. Like, they wanted, like, an older home, and I was, like, this one is -- I don't like to -- I -- like, it makes me nervous to sell, you know, the older, like, bungalow homes

because they were built 50, 80 years ago, and there's so many foundation issues. And I was, like, I just know this is going to be the perfect house for you to retire in. You're not going to end up spending \$50,000 just to fix things. Like, it's perfect for you guys as it is. Like, you don't have to make any changes to it, and so that's kind of the story on, like, why we kind of picked this exact house because I knew this was the neighborhood that, like, they will love the neighborhood. The neighbors will love them. I think they will just, like, fit in very well. And so I think that -- and their goal, they're -- they want to be here often. Like, they have -- they have already came down four or five times since we've started looking for homes, and I love them. Like, that's the thing about, like, my -- a lot of my real estate clients, I just end up, like, seem very different with them. And I just care about them. And I think that -- I really think they will fit in with the neighborhood, and, yeah.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you, Ms. Simpson. You might want to pick up the pop thing. Any questions for this speaker? Commissioner Stanton, did you have something?

MR. STANTON: Yes. So you -- you're an agent for other Airbnbs?

MS. SIMPSON: Yeah. I think -- I don't know if I'm confused on what, like, the designated agent means, because you said, like --

MR. STANTON: Okay.

MS. SIMPSON: -- would a family member be better, so I am the host.

MR. STANTON: So the designated agent -- okay. So the designated agent is the person that we call at 3:00 in the morning --

MS. SIMPSON: Yes. Yes.

MR. STANTON: -- that's going down --

MS. SIMPSON: Yes. Yes. That's me. I don't sleep, ever.

MR. STANTON: it's a party, it can happen, who is coming to make that right?

MS. SIMPSON: Yes. Yes. Yes. That would be me.

MR. STANTON: That's you?

MS. SIMPSON: Yes.

MR. STANTON: Okay.

MS. SIMPSON: I would prefer you to call me than one of her family members --

MR. STANTON: Okay.

MS. SIMPSON: who might not answer the phone.

MR. STANTON: I'm trying to think, have I -- have you been here before -- before us as an agent for somebody's other property?

MR. SIMPSON: No.

MR. STANTON: Okay. I told you my requirements.

MS. SIMPSON: Yeah.

MR. STANTON: I've got to be -- I'm -- I -- I built this house, so I'm just going to own it. I built this house with youth in a neighborhood that is historically African-American with African-American history

bleeding through it. It's bleeding through my veins right now. How are you going to main-- show me you're going to maintain this house and its history and its integrity, and all of that, and get the right people to rent it and all of that. Convince me.

MS. SIMPSON: So I have been a host for 10 years. I have been a host -- I started hosting in California. Then I started managing. My next job was managing Airbnbs, multiple Airbnbs remotely from Florida. I did that for years. I never had one single issue managing from Missouri. I went down. I set up a team. So if I can do it from, you know, half of the country away, I can do it. I mean, I already -- I am doing it. I can -- I know what I'm doing. I have a handyman on staff. I don't have my own staff, but, you know, he's my 1099 guy. I have cleaners. And maybe this home is not going to directly to a family, but my cleaners are single moms. Like, I'm a single mom, this is why my baby is here right here. So all of my cleaners are actually, like, the City regulations are really hurting my cleaners, to be honest, because most of my Airbnbs are pulling out. And they're begging me. They're, like, please, we need more work. And I'm, like, I'm trying. Like, I operate one of my own properties, and it's at a loss. And I, like, have had to take it off, because of Airbnb regulations. And so I'm looking for opportunities to give these moms because they're working full-time jobs, and they're cleaning -- they want to clean every single day after they get off work to make more money, because I pay them very well. Like, better than anybody else. And so, they -- I mean, I wish -- I can bring them, and they can speak. They know how I run it, and they kind of -- they help me. We're a team. Like, my cleaners have access to all the messages, so if there's a chance that I'm asleep at 3:00 a.m. and one of them is awake, one of them, like, watches the messages like a hawk. I'm, like, okay, let me do my job sometimes, but she will step in if for some reason, I'm asleep at 3:00 in the morning and someone has an issue. So, I mean, that doesn't really ever happen, to be honest, but I have a tight ship and my properties, they're always, like, the nicest on the block. I mean, for a short-term rental, you can't have, like, someone drive up to a scraggly property with unmowed grass and trash in the yard. Like, that's going to get a bad review. It has to look better than any other property on the street.

MR. STANTON: Would the owner be open to the mid-term kind of rental, like, for nurses that are here for three months, blah, blah, blah, blah, blah, blah.

MS. SIMPSON: Oh, yeah. Yeah. And I have a lot -- because I'm a realtor, I have people that we have like a listserv. And so it will be, like, I may have someone looking -- I have someone looking. And so I put those -- honestly, now I'm trying to move a lot of Airbnbs over to mid-term, which is, like, kind of a rock and a hard place because it's like then the City is not getting any money for that. And my cleaners don't get to clean every week, they're only cleaning every three months. So it's kind of -- it's easier on me because I don't have to message everybody all the time, but, yeah. They're -- and I told them that there is -- you know, we have the 210-night maximum, but we -- if we want to fill it up more than that, then we can turn it over to mid-term rental, and just give both -- not permit, I guess, rental occupancy compliance.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any other questions? I've got a couple. So have you also helped them put in an application for a long-term rental occupancy permit?

MS. SIMPSON: We haven't done anything yet because they haven't -- they closed on it a couple of months ago and they -- she's the -- she says she hasn't lived there, but she's been basically staying there the whole time since.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Right. But did you help them fill out this application, or were you helping them with that at all, or do they just do this part on their own?

MS. SIMPSON: They did it on their own.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Okay. You manage -- and I say manage. You host other properties?

MS. SIMPSON: Yes.

MS. GEUEA JONES: You understand that --

MS. SIMPSON: A few at the lake, other places -- Hartsburg.

MS. GEUEA JONES: You understand the difference between hosting and being the designated agent. Right?

MS. SIMPSON: I -- I think there's a blurred line. I think it's the same thing. If there's any issue, someone is going to call me. If there's an issue with a guest, if there's an issue with the City, I'm the point of contact.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Well, the difference is the designated agent is responsible in the City's eyes --

MS. SIMPSON: Yeah.

MS. GEUEA JONES: -- for what happens on the license.

MS. SIMPSON: Yes.

MS. GEUEA JONES: There is another property that I believe you manage, 3408 Eastham Drive?

MS. SIMPSON: Yes.

MS. GEUEA JONES: That was before us last week.

MS. SIMPSON: I think it was --

MS. GEUEA JONES: Or two weeks ago, yeah. Our last meeting. Not last week, our last meeting.

MS. SIMPSON: Okay.

MS. GEUEA JONES: One of my concerns there was it sounded like there wasn't good communication. So can you explain how you, as the host, communicate with the owners, because, presumably, you're not sitting on the owner's escrow account or something to do all of these repairs and stuff. Like, you -- it's not your property. You have to get permission. So how do you communicate with the owners of the property if something goes wrong?

MS. SIMPSON: I mean, so say there -- a guest says, hey, there's a toilet running. Then I tell the owner, hey, we need to get someone in. Do you need me to get it, or do you have a person to come today? Like, a toilet running, we need to do it immediately. It's not, like, oh, the dryer went out, and we'll do it next week, you know. So is that what you're asking?

MS. GEUEA JONES: Yeah. What I'm -- what I'm asking is what -- I guess what I'm asking is

this. Like, if -- unlike if you are just the host and somebody else is the designated agent, if the police get called while this -- there are guests there, and you're the host, you're never going to hear from the police, but you are going to hear from the police if you have a designated agent. The City is going to be calling you, and you have to respond. And then -- and -- and I think my -- concern may be too strong of a word, but I want to make sure that you understand that your obligations go beyond advertising the property. Does that make sense?

MS. SIMPSON: Yeah. Yeah. And I totally -- I totally stepped in that role. They've asked me that, like, that's -- now if there was something to -- that has never happened at any of my properties. But if that were to happen, I would expect for the police to call me and I would expect to be the one to respond.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Uh-huh. Because you're the listed designated agent?

MS. SIMPSON: Because I'm the host, but yes. To me -- I think to me, and I think supports what you're saying. It's one to me.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Uh-huh.

MS. SIMPSON: There's not, like, a difference. Just because they're different -- a homeowner, yes. But I -- like, you know, Airbnb becomes passive only when you don't have to do anything. Right? Short-term rental. And so I want this to be passive opportunity for my owners. They can be involved, as involved as they want. They can be in their property as much as they want. But I am taking care of organizing everything, any issues, any repairs. Does that make sense?

MS. GEUEA JONES: Okay. It does, and again, I'm just -- there -- there -- there is --

MS. SIMPSON: I'm happy to -- if something were to happen and the police were to contact me, I would absolutely welcome that.

MS. GEUEA JONES: There is front line response, which would be you, and then there's ultimate responsibility, which would be the owners.

MS. SIMPSON: Yes.

MS. GEUEA JONES: My concern is to make sure that when you are contacted as the front line response, you are also communicating that to the owners every time without fail?

MS. SIMPSON: Oh, yeah. That's totally -- that's no problem. I've never had police contact me for any of these I've ever had, so --

MS. GEUEA JONES: I'm not talking about necessarily police, but also, like, Neighborhood Services for grass being too long, or the trash bins being out, or neighbors complaining about marijuana smell, or any of that kind of stuff; you see what I'm saying?

MS. SIMPSON: But -- yeah. I think you're crossing over with Eastham right now, we never -- we didn't get contacted for that. So --

MS. GEUEA JONES: And, see, this is -- what I want to make sure is that since you are the designated agent, if you hear about things like that, which I don't think -- I'm not saying that's going to be a problem at this property. But what I am saying is you have an obligation to report everything you hear

to the owners, and I want to make sure that you understand that that -- that is more serious now that you're on the official paperwork as a registered agent, than if you're just the host in a way that is not legally binding under the laws of licensure of the City. Does that make sense?

MS. SIMPSON: Yeah. I think I already, like, have that expectation.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Okay.

MS. SIMPSON: So that doesn't seem like a new, you know, like a new avenue or a new role for me.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you. Any other questions?

MR. STANTON: I have one more.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Commissioner Stanton?

MR. STANTON: How many -- do you have any properties in the central city that you host or A designated agent for?

MS. SIMPSON: I have two of my own. One is a mid-term. One has been -- has been an Airbnb. I'm trying to decide if I'm in the process of selling it, or -- I don't know what I'm going to do with it. Since I had my baby, my family stays there a lot because they're not located in Columbia, so we all go and stay there because they go to my property. So I don't know. What -- I might turn it into a mid-term. I'm kind of emotionally attached to it, but I don't know yet what to do with that one.

MR. STANTON: Thank you.

MS. SIMPSON: There is no one in it now. It's vacant.

MR. STANTON: Okay. Thank you.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Anyone else? Seeing none. Thank you for being here tonight. I believe everyone has had a chance to speak. Yes. Then I will close public comment.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

MS. GEUEA JONES: And we will go to Commissioner comments. Are there any Commissioner comments on this case? Oh, sorry. Jesse, yes?

MR. CRAIG: If I -- if I may, Madam Chair, I've got a couple of comments before -- before we proceed with this.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Please?

MR. CRAIG: Just as a -- I don't want to confuse the issues. This is actually meant to clarify some Commissioner questions. I looked at the Recorder of Deeds on this property, and to Commissioner Walters' point, and a couple of other questions, Job Point conveyed this property in 2013. The applicant is a third subsequent -- there's three degrees of separation from Job Point to the applicant. Looking at the initial deed conveying from Job Point to the initial buyer, I see nothing in a restriction. However, even if there were, or I'm missing something, much like an HOA restrictive covenant, that is for Job Point to enforce and not the City. Second point, question for Commissioner Stanton. Although you have no financial investment in this -- in this case which would require you to recuse yourself, it sounds like it has some emotional investment. Are you certain you can be objective and dispassionate in your vote tonight?

MR. STANTON: I think my test-- I think my -- I think the record will show you that I am. That's number one. Number two, I've built so many, I couldn't remember myself until somebody reminded me of such. That's number two. I'm passionate about a lot of things that happen in this Commission, and it's never swayed my vote on anything. So to answer your question, I think the record will reflect the answer that you seek.

MR. CRAIG: Very good.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Is that --

MR. CRAIG: Yeah. That's all for me.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you. Any --

MR. ZENNER: Ms. Chairman?

MS. GEUEA JONES: Mr. Zenner, yes.

MR. ZENNER: So I -- to add onto Mr. Craig's comments, I happen to have our housing -- an Affordable Housing Fee Waiver ordinance in front of me. The Affordable Housing Fee Waiver ordinance was originally adopted in 2016, many years after this home was constructed, and actually three years after the home was sold from Job Point. The current ordinance, which was amended in 2018 to include provisions dealing with short- or accessory dwelling units being added also provided a time period in which repayment should a CHDO, a housing authority taking -- a housing entity taking money from the City to build that home, established a five-year term limit for repayment. So this home was sold from Job Point in 2013. According to the Assessor's records, it was built in 2011. So whatever the conveyance was at that point, it was actually purchased in 2009 from the former owner by Job Point. 2009 to 2011 was when the home was built. It was not sold until 2013. I would suggest to you that if the ordinance that we currently have that deals with housing fee waiver were in place, which it was not, all obligations for repayment would have been expired by this point.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you. Any other Commissioner comment? Commissioner Stanton?

MR. STANTON: To defend myself, I think I made that clear to both parties that need to hear that. I made that clear that -- that that had probably expired by the time this situation came up. So that's been on the record and that's been said.

MR. CRAIG: That's fair. I just wanted to get that on the record, you know.

MR. STANTON: Okay.

MR. CRAIG: This isn't an attack or a doubt that you can do that. I just wanted to get it on the record that you can be dispassionate --

MR. STANTON: I'm a good counterpart either way.

MR. CRAIG: Yeah. Yeah.

MR. STANTON: Okay.

MR. ZENNER: And I just wanted to make sure that we all understand, from a staff perspective, this is a topic that generally does not come up from an evaluation perspective, though the ordinance that would be applicable would be beginning in basically 2016 and moving forward. So homes that may have

taken fee waiver responsibilities as a five-year window before they may be resold without having to do any repayment, the ordinance currently that is in place also restricts the use of a short-term rental -- or, I apologize -- an accessory dwelling unit being converted to a short-term rental, specifically culled out, and that was a component that was adopted in 2018. So if you took a fee waiver for an ADU, it cannot be used for short-term rental purposes, and that's very explicit. So we will take note of this particular conversation this evening as we potentially look through further applications as they come in. Depending on the area that they are in, it could be more pronounced that we may need to be more diligent in that evaluation. So that was the only reason I wanted to bring up the points that I have brought up. We do have means by which to evaluate those types of homes that have received City funding that used fee waiver and that we can verify that, as well.

MR. STANTON: And it is a -- it is a pertinent discussion because unless you have a trigger, you wouldn't know. Like, this house, where if a land trust person had a home and tried to make it a short-term rental, and how will we catch that? Due to the fact we are in the central city, there's been a lot of properties that have had affordable housing assistance, so that's why this is a very relevant question, and I'm glad that we have an answer to that. But it will come up if they -- if we start addressing central city homes in that way.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Commissioner Gray, do you have something?

DR. GRAY: I think I have a question for Mr. Zenner. I know we've talked before in other cases about some of the tensions between the priorities of policies within the Comprehensive Plan, and I guess I'm wondering if there are any, like, considerations with the policies around livable and sustainable communities given the information that we've received today that we might want to consider.

MR. ZENNER: I mean, a livable and sustainable community is consistent of a variety of housing topologies with people of varying purposes of why they may own property, and the incomes that are going to be evolved with that. The ability to provide housing that offers something that is not what traditionally may be provided does meet an objective. And so, short-term rental usage of a single-family dwelling unit or an apartment unit that is within a broader building, as we have seen, offers opportunities to create livable environments for short-term rental tenants that aren't interested in a mid-term rental, they are here enjoying our community. So I would suggest to you that it is part of an overall broader concept. Specifically, our -- our -- the regulatory development process that we went through with spacing requirements, with licensure limitations, all of those conditions that are part of the evaluation process are designed to ensure that we are not bleeding away the opportunity to leave affordable housing. Private property rights and the ability to acquire property for personal purposes and usage is something that exists, and it is attention that we do have to address. As Mr. Stanton pointed out, this process was created so property owners who desire to use this vehicle had to come and get approval. They had to come and ask for permission, and because this is not their principal residence, it is elevated that much higher to the conditional use stage. If this was their principal home, and they wanted to exit the home up to 120 nights annually, they could do that without having to be before anybody. We wouldn't have put a

sign out front, they would have sought to get a license and been able to have operated the house in an exact same way. Because they are not the primary tenant and they want more -- or the primary resident, and they want more than 120 nights, they come through this process. And so, conditionally, I mean, I think when we weigh the -- when you have to weigh the scale, you have to put it on the scale and you have to weigh it, spacing requirements, compliance with other technical standards, and then the purview of the Commission to say, well, the applicant indicated they wanted 210 nights, is 210 nights appropriate? Maybe we want more mid-term rental in this neighborhood, not as much short-term. That is within the purview of this body. You can restrict with the accepted -- with or without the acceptance of the applicant. It's best if you get the acceptance of the applicant, or you can restrict the total number of guests based upon what the sight is capable of accommodating. And Paula is correct. Ms. Clayton is correct. In the discussions with me in preparation of this application, as we have done in several other applications, we suggested to ask for more than you know you are capable of to avoid the opportunity that, should the use be successful, that you can make the improvement necessary and not come back through the process. We get through this once, but we, from an administrative perspective, will not allow that license to be any greater than what the capacity of the property is at the time of licensure. So that is why they are seeking -- that's why the application says six. It was at the advice of staff, and at the advice of staff, not to answer Ms. Geuea Jones' question, they have not sought long-term rental at this point because if they seek long-term rental separate from short-term rental, they are subject to a dual payment of fees and separate inspections. If they do it together as a single application, it is one inspection and one inspection fee, and that would be more consistent with the processing of this application. First, figure out if you are going to be approved for a short-term rental use, and if you're not -- if you are, you haven't expended extra money. If you are not, you're going to spend the same amount of money to get the long-term rental license in order to make this property viable as an income property in your absence. And so that is the general approach we take with many of our applicants. If the time frame is so long and they are eager to begin receiving revenue from a mid-term rental, we will advise them to apply for the short -- or the long-term rental license prior to even coming here in order to save the two-and-a-half to three-month delay that they will be having to carry that house without any possible revenue. And that would be very consistent with making sure that that home is available for long-term -- more long-term related tenants. In this particular instance, this applicant has not indicated an interest in doing that, so that's why they have not applied for the long-term rental license.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Thank you. Anything else, Commissioner Gray?

DR. GRAY: No.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any other Commissioner comments? Commissioner Darr?

MR. DARR: I'm willing to support for a maximum of four guests.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Commissioner Brodsky?

MR. BRODSKY: Yeah. I'll echo what -- Commissioner Darr's statement. You know, just looking at the items that we look at when we approve these, I think to kick this up to six guests with a giant

concrete parking pad out front would not be in character with the neighborhood, and it sounds like the applicant is -- is agreeable to that four-guest limitation. So I would be in support of this application with that maximum of four transient guests.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Any other Commissioner comment? Seeing none. Would anyone like to make a motion?

MR. WALTERS: I would.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Go ahead, Commissioner Walters.

MR. WALTERS: And for the benefit of the audience, all motions we make are in the affirmative. I -- regarding Case Number 11-2026, I recommend -- I recommend approval of that requested STR CUP subject to maximum occupancy of four transient guests, maximum of 210 nights of annual rental usage, and that the one-car garage be made available when the dwelling is used for STR purposes.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Is there a second?

MS. ORTIZ: Second.

MS. GEUEA JONES: Moved by Commissioner Walters, seconded by Commissioner Ortiz. Is there any discussion on the motion? Seeing none. Commissioner Brodsky, if you're ready, may we have a roll call?

Roll Call Vote (Voting "yes" is to recommend approval.) Voting Yes: Mr. Walters, Mr. Brodsky, Mr. Darr, Ms. Ortiz. Voting No: Mr. Stanton, Ms. Stockton, Ms. Geuea Jones, Dr. Gray. The vote is tied, 4 to 4.

MR. BRODSKY: The motion is a tie, so I believe that would be no recommendation?

MS. GEUEA JONES: That will be no recommendation, which I believe is treated negatively at City Council?

MR. ZENNER: Correct. And it will go under old business.

MS. GEUEA JONES: It will go under old business, which means that it will have a full public hearing and not be on the consent agenda. And I can't tell you what the schedule is, but call tomorrow and -- and you can get that information from Mr. Zenner. Okay. That was our last case for the evening. So with that concluded, we'll go to Public Comments.